

IEEE 802.1 Interim Meeting

Santa Cruz, CA, USA

802.1 Meeting Minutes, - September 2012

Attendees

<i>Last Name</i>	<i>First Name</i>	<i>Middle Name</i>	<i>Affiliation</i>
Allan	David		Ericsson AB
Bahr	Michael		Siemens AG
Boiger	Christian		Deggendorf University of Applied Sciences, Hirschmann Automation and Control
Booth	Brad		Dell
Bragg	Nigel		ciena
Chang	Xin		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Cummings	Rodney		National Instruments Corporation
Eastlake 3rd	Donald		Huawei R&D USA
Farkas	Janos		Ericsson
Finn	Norman		Cisco Systems, Inc.
FREDETTE	ANDRE		Extreme Networks
Ghanwani	Anoop		Dell
Gravel	Mark		Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.
Grow	Robert		RMG Standards Consulting, MOST Co-Operation
GU	HWERS		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Gunther	Craig		Harman International
Hares	Susan		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Jeffree	Anthony		HP, Broadcom
Johas Teener	Michael		Broadcom Corporation
Jones	Girault		Apple, Inc.
Kamath	Daya		IBM
Kim	Yongbum		Broadcom Corporation
Klein	Philippe		Broadcom Corporation
Lynch	Jeff		IBM
Mack-Crane	Thomas		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
McIntosh	James		Vitesse Semiconductor Corporation
Messenger	John		ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.
Mihalache	Razvan		Robert Bosch GmbH
Moldovansky	Anatoly		Rockwell Automation
Muyshondt	Henry		MOST Cooperation
Pannell	Donald		Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.
Parsons	Glenn		Ericsson AB
Ramamurthy	Shankara		Extreme Networks

Randall	Karen	NSA/IAD
Rouyer	Jessy	ALCATEL-LUCENT
Saltsidis	Panagiotis	Ericsson AB
Seaman	Michael	Individual
Sexton	Daniel	General Electric Company (GE)
Steiner	Wilfried	TTTech Computertechnik AG
Stokes	Olen	Extreme Networks
Thaler	Patricia	Broadcom Corporation
Tretter	Albert	Siemens AG
Weis	Brian	Cisco Systems, Inc.
Winkel	Ludwig	Siemens AG

Task Group Minutes

Interworking minutes

Monday 10 September

Meeting called to order at 9:00am.

Stephen Haddock presented the preliminary agenda for the week.

Stephen Haddock presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

Stephen Haddock introduced two liaisons received since the last meeting. Time permitting, these will be discussed later in the week.

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/liaison-bbf2012-1068-01-liaison-to-ieee-ietf-and-itu-regardingwt-304-status-0912.doc>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/liaison-mef-100156-000-liaison-on-linktrace-trigger-ranganathan-0812.doc>

802.1Qbp ECMP: Ben Mack-Crane conducted comment resolution on the task group ballot for 802.1Qbp-d1.1 SPBM Equal Cost MultiPath.

<http://iee802.org/1/files/private/bp-drafts/d1/802-1bp-d1-1-pdis.pdf>

Break at 12:15 pm for lunch.

Interworking Task Group called to order at 1:15pm.

802.1AX-Rev DRNI: Norm Finn reviewed changes in the new draft of 802.1AX-REV-d0.3 Link Aggregation with Distributed Resilient Network Interconnect, and gave a presentation on a proposed mechanism for managing link and gateway selection. Nigel Bragg review the presentation he gave during last week's conference call regarding split brain detection. Janos Farkas gave a presentation regarding a proposal for controlling split brain scenarios.

<http://iee802.org/1/files/private/ax-rev-drafts/d0/802-1AX-REV-d0-3.pdf>

<http://iee802.org/1/files/private/ax-rev-drafts/d0/802-1AX-REV-d0-3-cb.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/ax-rev-nfinn-port-selection-0912-v01.pdf>

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/axrev-farkas-split-brain-handling-0912-v01.pdf>

New Work: Bob Grow presented a draft PAR for an amendment to 802.1AC to add a section for using MOST as a media supporting the ISS on a bridge. These links are to modified draft PAR and five criteria:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-PAR-Grow-PARdetail-0912-v02.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-PAR-Grow-MOSTPARContent-0912-v02.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-PAR-Grow-FiveCriteria-0912-v02.pdf>

Adjourn at 5:15pm.

Tuesday 11 September

Joint meeting of Interworking and AVB task groups called to order at 9:00am.

Michael Teener made an announcement regarding the social this evening.

Stephen Haddock gave the call for patents. There was no response to the call for patents.

802.1/802.11 Bridging: Norm Finn gave a presentation on possible models of an 802.11 LAN as seen by a bridged network, and advocated modeling the wireless LAN as a set of point to point links. Phillippe gave a presentation advocating modeling the wireless LAN as a distributed bridge.

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-nfynn-11-medium-choice-0812-v03.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-phk1-11-bbs-bridging-0812-v4.pdf>

Break at 12:00 pm.

Resume at 1:00pm

802.1/802.11 Bridging: Norm Finn presented proposed PARs and 5 criteria for a wired-wireless Bridging project to amend 802.1Q and 802.11.

<http://ieee802.org/1/private/contrib/new-nfynn-wired-wireless-par5c-0512-v03.pdf>

AVB: Presentations were given by Michael Bahr on routing industrial control data traffic, and by Wilfried Steiner on fault hypothesis in AVB and redundancy management. Janos Farkas presented proposed PAR and 5 criteria for a project on SPB Path Control and Reservation:

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-avb-bahr-goetz-L2-routing-control-data-traffic-industry.pdf>

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-avb-wsteiner-fault-hypothesis-and-redundancy-management-0912-v01.pdf>

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-farkas-spbpcr-draft-par5c-0912-v01.pdf>

Adjourn at 5:00pm.

Wednesday 12 September

Meeting called to order at 9:00am.

Stephen Haddock presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

802.1Qbp ECMP: Ben Mack-Crane continued comment resolution on the task group ballot for 802.1Qbp-d1.1 SPBM Equal Cost MultiPath.

Break at 12:15 pm.

Resume at 1:15pm

802.1AX-Rev DRNI: Stephen Haddock gave presentations on a proposed structure for the Intra-Portal Protocol and on issues related to MEP placement and link selection criteria:

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/axrev-haddock-rough-intra-portal-protocol-0912-v03.ppt>

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/axrev-haddock-link-selection-and-OAM-0712-v01.ppt>

Adjourn at 4:20pm.

Thursday 13 September

Meeting called to order at 9:00am.

Stephen Haddock presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

AVB: Janos Farkas reviewed and edited the proposed PAR and 5 criteria for a project on SPB Path Control and Reservation.

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-p802-1qca-draft-par-5c-0912-v02.pdf>

802.1/802.11 Bridging: Norm Finn summarized edits to the proposed PARs and 5 criteria for a wired-wireless Bridging project to amend 802.1Q and 802.11.

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-nfinn-wired-wireless-par5c-0512-v05.pdf>

Miscellaneous: Tissa Senevirathne gave an update on the discussions regarding leveraging 802.1ag for OAM on TRILL. Note that this is not an official liaison, but it is a report on discussions that have included both IETF and IEEE participants.

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/liaison-tissa-oam-ieee-trill-0912-v02.pptx>

Liaison: There was discussion of the liaison received from the MEF regarding a MIB trigger for transmitting Link Trace Messages. There is general agreement that the MIB text is vague in how LTMs are triggered. There are several potential ways to resolve this, one of which is to affirm that the triggering event is a write to the flags parameter (which is the original intent and the interpretation that the MEF liaison assumed). The plan is to decide whether this will be the response to the liaison, or whether some alternative trigger should be considered, at the November plenary in San Antonio.

802.1Qbp ECMP: Ben Mack-Crane continued comment resolution on the task group ballot for 802.1Qbp-d1.1 SPBM Equal Cost MultiPath.

Break at 12:15 pm.

Resume at 1:00pm

802.1Qbp ECMP: Ben Mack-Crane concluded comment resolution on the task group ballot for 802.1Qbp-d1.1 SPBM Equal Cost MultiPath.

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/bp-mackcrane-editor-report-0912.pdf>

<http://iee802.org/1/files/private/bp-drafts/d1/802-1bp-d1-1-dis.pdf>

802.1AX-Rev DRNI: Stephen Haddock showed a slide summarizing the conclusion from yesterday's presentation. This slide is included in an updated version of the presentation:

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/axrev-haddock-link-selection-and-OAM-0712-v02.ppt>

Miscellaneous: Stephen Haddock led a brief discussion regarding how an 802.1Q implementation of a Rooted Multipoint service and CFM compares to the MEF SOAM-FM model for an E-TREE service.

New Work: Bob Grow reviewed some minor editorial changes in the draft PAR for adding a section on Ethernet over MOST to 802.1AC:

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-PAR-Grow-FiveCriteria-0912-v03.pdf>

Adjourn at 2:40pm.

AVB Minutes

In the following meeting notes, these abbreviations are used:

- MJT – Michael Johas-Teener
- Adva – Adva Optical Networking
- GG – Geoff Garner
- FG – Franz-Josef Geotz
- DP – Don Pannell
- RC – Rodney Cummings
- CB – Christian Boiger
- MB – Michael Bahr, J. Gotz
- NF – Norm Finn
- PK – Philipe Klein
- AF – Andre Fredette

Monday 10 September

Michael opened the meeting at 9:10am with the patent slides.

Rodney Cummings presented 802.1Qbv: Performance / Complexity Tradeoffs

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/Qbv-cummings-performance-tradeoffs-0912-v2.pdf>

Rodney Cummings presented 802.1Qbv: Feedback on Draft 0.0

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/Qbv-cummings-feedback-draft00-0912-v1.pdf>

Christian Boiger presented Time Aware Shaper

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/bv-boiger-time-aware-shaper-0912-v02.pdf>

Albert Tretter presented Aspects for Pre-emption resp. Time Aware Blocking Shaper (TABS)

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/avb-tretter-AspecPreemptTabs-0910.ppt>

Yong Kim lead a discussion on strategies ideas for CFI for Distinguished Minimum Latency Traffic in a Converged Tragic Environment

Tuesday 11 September

Joint session with the Interworking group. The IEEE patent slides were shown/read.

Norm Finn presented Picking a model for 802.11/802.1 bridging

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-nfynn-11-medium-choice-0812-v03.pdf>

Philippe presented CSN & 802.11 BSS Bridging

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-phk1-11-bbs-bridging-0812-v4.pdf>

Norm Finn presented a proposed PAR for Wired-Wireless Bridging

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-nfynn-wired-wireless-par5c-0512-v03.pdf>

The discussion of the group then covered multi path & redundancy issues:

Michael Bahr presented L2 Routing for Control Data Traffic @ Industry

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-avb-bahr-goetz-L2-routing-control-data-traffic-industry.pdf>

Wilfried Steiner presented Fault-Hypothesis of IEEE 802.1 Q AVB and Redundancy Management

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-avb-wsteiner-fault-hypothesis-and-redundancy-management-0912-v01.pdf>

Janos Farkas presented SPB Path Control and Reservation (SPB-PCR) draft PAR and 5C

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-farkas-spbpcr-draft-par5c-0912-v01.pdf>

Wednesday 12 September

Rodney Cummings presented Request for Contribution for Refining the Seamless Redundancy Concept Presented in San Diego

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/new-avb-kleineberg-jochim-seamless-redundancy-0912v2.pdf>

Jeff Garner (via phone) presented Brief Overview of Work in ITU-T Q13/15 on Transport of Time via PTP

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/as-garner-overview-q13-work-time-transport-ntp.pdf>

Don Pannell presented P802.1Qbv Small Frame Handling

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2012/Qbv-pannell-small-frame-handling-0912-v1.pdf>