

Title: Liaison response to New LNI 4.0 whitepaper – IEEE SA Logo request
From: IEEE 802.1
For: Information
Contacts: Glenn Parsons, Chair, IEEE 802.1 WG, glenn.parsons@ericsson.com,
Jessy Rouyer, Vice-Chair, IEEE 802.1, jessy.rouyer@nokia.com,
Karen Randall, Liaison Secretary, IEEE 802.1, karen@randall-consulting.com,
Dr. János Farkas, Chair, IEEE 802.1 TSN TG, janos.farkas@ericsson.com,
Craig Gunther, Vice-Chair, IEEE 802.1 TSN TG, craiggunther@yahoo.com,
Johannes Specht, Secretary, IEEE 802.1 TSN TG, johannes.specht.standards@gmail.com,
Ludwig Winkel, Chair, IEC/IEEE 60802, ludwig.winkel@online.de,
Josef Dorr, Secretary, IEC/IEEE 60802, josef.dorr@siemens.com,
Paul Nikolich, Chair, IEEE 802, p.nikolich@ieee.org,
Ron Hotchkiss, Program Manager, IEEE SA Operational Program Management, r.w.hotchkiss@ieee.org,
To: Lab Networks Industrie 4.0, info@lni40.de,
Thomas Hahn, CEO, Lab Networks Industrie 4.0, hahn.th@siemens.com,
Dr. Dominik Rohrmus, CTO, LNI 4.0 e.V., dominik.rohrmus@siemens.com,
Petra Stockamp, LNI 4.0 e.V., petra.stockamp@telekom.de,
Dr. Karl Weber, Beckhoff Automation GmbH & Co. KG, karl.weber@beckhoff.com
Date: March 16, 2023

Dear Mr. Hahn and Colleagues,

Thank you for the update on the LNI 4.0 TSN testbed plugfest and for sharing your whitepaper.

We highly appreciate your efforts in the implementation of our technology. We think that the dialogue between our organizations is beneficial for the development of TSN.

Approving the use of the IEEE logo or the IEEE SA logo (or any other IEEE logo) is not up to the IEEE 802.1 WG. It requires evaluations, request and approval from the appropriate part of the IEEE organization. Further discussion would be needed between our organizations before such request could be placed. For instance, better understanding on the purpose of the use of the logo and the LNI 4.0 testbed details would be needed, e.g., which TSN standards are part of the testbed, the compliance of the testbed to IEEE 802 standards, etc.

We would share a few comments to your whitepaper for your consideration:

The Ethernet standard is IEEE Std 802.3 Ethernet, which is part of the IEEE 802 standards. Along these lines, the first sentence of section 2 could be updated to something like: “TSN is a set of IEEE 802 standards for real-time communication. TSN has been primarily developed for IEEE Std 802.3 Ethernet.” The last paragraph could be updated along the lines: “TSN is specified by IEEE 802.1 standards, primarily for IEEE Std 802.3 Ethernet. TSN provides determinism and convergence in the ISO/OSI Layer 2. TSN mechanisms include time synchronization, reliability, traffic shaping, and resource management. The IEC/IEEE 60802 Joint Project defines TSN profiles for industrial automation.” (Note that “resiliency” means dynamic reconfiguration (e.g., RSTP), which is often not preferable for TSN streams.)

We look forward to the continued dialogue between our organizations.

Respectfully submitted,
Glenn Parsons
Chair, IEEE 802.1 Working Group