Title: Liaison response to your 11 March 2022 liaison on Use of the IEEE 802.1X YANG model in BBF-specified Access Nodes
From: IEEE 802.1 Working Group
For: Information
To: Lincoln Lavoie, Broadband Forum Technical Committee Chair, lylavoie@iol.unh.edu
            Ken Ko, Broadband Forum Managing Director, kko@broadband-forum.org
            Kevin Noll, Broadband Forum Liaison Officer to the IEEE 802.1 Working Group, kevin.noll@vecima.com
            April Nowicki, Broadband Forum Member Support Manager, anowicki@broadband-forum.org
            Joey Boyd, Work Area Director Common YANG, joey.boyd@adtran.com
            Sven Ooghe, Work Area Director Common YANG, sven.ooghe@nokia.com
            Liaisons at BBF, liaisons@broadband-forum.org
Copy: Glenn Parsons, Chair, IEEE 802.1, glenn.parsons@ericsson.com
            Jessy Rouyer, Vice-Chair, IEEE 802.1, jessy.rouyer@nokia.com
            Mick Seaman, Chair, IEEE 802.1 Security Task Group, mickseaman@gmail.com
            Scott Mansfield, Chair, IEEE 802.1 YANGsters, scott.mansfield@ericsson.com
            Paul Nikolich, Chair, IEEE 802, p.nikolich@ieee.org
            Karen Randall, Liaison Secretary, IEEE 802.1, karen@randall-consulting.com
            Ron Hotchkiss, Program Manager, IEEE SA Operational Program Management, r.w.hotchkiss@ieee.org
Date: 16 March 2023

Dear Colleagues,

The IEEE 802.1 Working Group would like to thank Broadband Forum for the information provided in liaison statement on the use of the IEEE 802.1X YANG model in BBF-specified Access Nodes.

IEEE 802.1 YANGsters and IEEE 802.1 Security Task Group have reviewed the liaison statement. The proposal to include the use of "derived-from-or-self" as described is deemed to be a backwards compatible change. Making the change to https://github.com/YangModels/yang/blob/main/standard/ieee/published/802.1/ieee802-dot1x.yang will require further discussion to determine how and when to incorporate the update. The proposal could also be usefully applied to IEEE Std 802.1AE YANG, when appropriate. We have submitted Maintenance Requests to initiate discussion on how best to implement the solutions.

However, IEEE Std 802.1X and IEEE Std 802.1AE specify that IEEE 802.1X authentication is not used on aggregated interfaces (e.g., IEEE Std 802.1AX Link Aggregation). It is used only on single interfaces or on each of the individual interfaces that are part of an aggregation. Specifically, IEEE Std 802.1AX Link Aggregation can be considered to provide an Ethernet-like interface (when aggregating individual IEEE Std 802.3 links), but IEEE Std 802.1AX-2020 (in clause 6.5) and IEEE Std 802.1AE-2018 (in clause 11.5) specify that IEEE Std 802.1X is used with the individual links and not with the aggregate.

Note that the IEEE 802 work is open and contribution driven. Participation is on an individual basis and technical discussion can be conducted based on individual contributions.

Respectfully submitted,
Glenn Parsons

Chair, IEEE 802.1 Working Group