P802.1ASdm/D1.2
Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for WG Recirculation Ballot

Version 3

Geoffrey M. Garner
Analog Devices, Inc. (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2023.10.02

Ballot Statistics – 1

❑Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	39	82.98
No (voters)	8	17.02
Voting Yes or No	47	100
Abstain Time	0	
Abstain Expertise	14	
Abstain Total	14	22.95
Respondents (who are voting members)	61	83.56
Voting Members	73	100
Non-voting member commenters	1	

Ballot Statistics

❑Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Number of Commenters	9	14.75 (percentage of voters responding)
Number of Comments	94	100.00
TR	27	28.72
T	6	6.38
ER	43	45.74
E	18	19.15

Comments by Category - 1

❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together

❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (23 comments)

  ▪ 14, 28, 30, 37, 38, 40, 41, 45, 47, 48, 55, 56, 58, 59, 60, 68, 69, 73, 80, (81, 82), 83, 84

  ▪ While the comments above are considered trivial, they will still be discussed; they are grouped together so they can be discussed together

❑ The comments on the following pages are considered to be non-trivial (71 comments)

  ▪ Note that some of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial

  ▪ Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

Comments by Category - 2

❏ Comments that have some relation to YANG (802.1ASdn) or incorporation of 802.1ASdr (15 comments; grouped comments are shown in parentheses):

- Figures and Tables in YANG Clause (Clause 17): 49, 70, 71, 50, 51

- Referring to the YANG module: 46, 79, 87

- Other YANG items: 53, 52, 54, 85, 4, 5

- Referring to 802.1ASdr: 89

❏ Other comments (55 comments):

- Permission to use definitions from IEEE 1588: 78, 88

- "Propagation Time" versus "Propagation Delay" terminology: 22

- Primitive parameters in clause 9: 57, 1, 2

- "Global variable" terminology: 42

- neighborRateRatio in Table 10-1: 35, 36

- Which version of NOTE 1 on p.48 to use: 13

- Comments in computeLogSyncIntervalFunction: 44

- Use only Sync messages to compute nRR (i.e., eliminate possibility to use Pdelay messages): 34

Comments by Category - 3

□Other comments (Cont.):

- How much detail of nRR computation using Sync messages and Drift_Tracking TLV should be described in 802.1ASdm: 3, 29, 33, 31, 32, 21

- Adding description of computation of nrrSync: (61, 65)

- Miscellaneous: 23, 24, 39, 25, 16, 15, 19, 17, 18, 27, 43, 63, 20, 64, 26, 66, 62, 77, 67, 72, 6, 8, 7, 86, 74, 75, 9, 76, 10, 11, 12, 90, 91, 92, 93, 94