

# P802.1ASdm/D1.1 Editor's Report

## Proposed Comment Resolution for WG Ballot

### Version 7

**Geoffrey M. Garner**  
**Analog Devices, Inc. (Consultant)**

**[gmgarner@alum.mit.edu](mailto:gmgarner@alum.mit.edu)**

*IEEE 802.1 TSN TG*  
2023.08.14

# Ballot Statistics - 1

---

☐ Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

| Category                             | All respondents |         |
|--------------------------------------|-----------------|---------|
|                                      | Total           | Percent |
| Yes (voters)                         | 33              | 80.49   |
| No (voters)                          | 8               | 19.51   |
| Voting Yes or No                     | 41              | 100     |
| Abstain Time                         | 1               |         |
| Abstain Expertise                    | 12              |         |
| Abstain Total                        | 13              | 24.07   |
| Respondents (who are voting members) | 54              | 73.97   |
| Voting Members                       | 73              | 100     |
| Non-voting member commenters         | 1               |         |

# Ballot Statistics

---

☐ Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

| Category             | All respondents |   |
|----------------------|-----------------|---|
|                      | Total           | Percent                                 |
| Number of Commenters | 16              | 30.77 (percentage of voters responding) |
| Number of Comments   | 131             | 100.00                                  |
| TR                   | 50              | 38.17                                   |
| T                    | 13              | 9.92                                    |
| ER                   | 32              | 24.43                                   |
| E                    | 36              | 27.48                                   |

# Comments by Category - 1

---

- ❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together
- ❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (14 comments)
  - (23, 48, 92), 27, 31, 35, (37, 80), 81, 95, 96, 100, 103, 112
- ❑ While the comments above are considered trivial, they will still be discussed; they are grouped together so they can be discussed together
- ❑ The comments on the following pages are considered to be non-trivial (124 comments)
  - Note that some of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial
  - Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

# Comments by Category - 2

---

□ Comments that have some relation to YANG or managed objects (15 comments; grouped comments are shown in parentheses):

- Addition of YANG and 802.1ASdr: (36, 119), 51, 73, 74, 117, 123
- Anti-flapping timer thresholds: 32, 97
- Items for which contributions were requested: (118, 17), (19, 20, 72), 18

□ Other comments (102 comments):

- Defaults in 5.4.1 and 5.4.3: 79, 122, 124, 125, 128
- Miscellaneous comments related to Clause 7: 77, 88, 110, 126, 127
- Notes/text indicating what has changed in figures: 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 111
- Editing instructions for figures: 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 49, 50, 86, 89, 90, 113, 114
- Numbering of figures (should the number be before or after applying editing instructions that are earlier in the text?): 82, 83
- domainNumber and sdold: 1, 2, 3, 4, 5
- Drift tracking TLV: (21, 94), 29, 120, 121

# Comments by Category - 3

---

## □ Other comments (Cont.):

- Removal of NOT\_CAPABLE and INITIALIZING states from HotStandbySystem state machine: 75
- NOTE 1 in 10.2.9.2.1: (6, 7)
- Sync receipt timeout: 52
- Subtype of EtherType: 14
- Instance-specific peer delay versus CMLDS: 10, 11, 12, 13, 93
- Computation of lastGmFrequencyChange: (26, 56, 57)
- Units of delayAsymmetry: (8, 25, 130)
- Peer delay calculation: (129, 131)
- Miscellaneous: 9, 22, 15, 16, 24, 28, 30, 33, (34, 98), 38, (39, 84), 40, 53, 54, 55, 76, 78, 85, 87, 91, 99, 101, 102, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 109, 115, 116
- Rogue comment – data type for driftTrackingTlvSupport: 132