P802.1ASdm/D1.1
Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for WG Ballot

Version 5

Geoffrey M. Garner
Analog Devices, Inc. (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG

2023.07.31

Ballot Statistics – 1

Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	33	80.49
No (voters)	8	19.51
Voting Yes or No	41	100
Abstain Time	1	
Abstain Expertise	12	
Abstain Total	13	24.07
Respondents (who are voting members)	54	73.97
Voting Members	73	100
Non-voting member commenters	1	

Ballot Statistics

☐Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Number of Commenters	16	30.77 (percentage of voters responding)
Number of Comments	131	100.00
TR	50	38.17
T	13	9.92
ER	32	24.43
E	36	27.48

Comments by Category - 1

❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together

❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (14 comments)

- ▪ (23, 48, 92), 27, 31, 35, (37, 80), 81, 95, 96, 100, 103, 112

❑ While the comments above are considered trivial, they will still be discussed; they are grouped together so they can be discussed together

❑ The comments on the following pages are considered to be non-trivial (124 comments)

- ▪ Note that some of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial
- ▪ Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

Comments by Category - 2

❑Comments that have some relation to YANG or managed objects (15 comments; grouped comments are shown in parentheses):

▪Addition of YANG and 802.1ASdr: (36, 119), 51, 73, 74, 117, 123

▪Anti-flapping timer thresholds: 32, 97

▪Items for which contributions were requested: (118, 17), (19, 20, 72), 18

❑Other comments (102 comments):

▪Defaults in 5.4.1 and 5.4.3: 79, 122, 124, 125, 128

▪Miscellaneous comments related to Clause 7: 77, 88, 110, 126, 127

▪Notes/text indicating what has changed in figures: 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 111

▪Editing instructions for figures: 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 49, 50, 86, 89, 90, 113, 114

▪Numbering of figures (should the number be before or after applying editing instructions that are earlier in the text?): 82, 83

▪domainNumber and sdoId: 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

▪Drift tracking TLV: (21, 94), 29, 120, 121

Comments by Category - 3

❑Other comments (Cont.):

- Removal of NOT_CAPABLE and INTIALIZING states from HotStandbySystem state machine: 75

- NOTE 1 in 10.2.9.2.1: (6, 7)

- Sync receipt timeout: 52

- Subtype of EtherType: 14

- Instance-specific peer delay versus CMLDS: 10, 11, 12, 13, 93

- Computation of lastGmFrequencyChange: (26, 56, 57)

- Units of delayAsymmetry: (8, 25, 130)

- Peer delay calculation: (129, 131)

- Miscellaneous: 9, 22, 15, 16, 24, 28, 30, 33, (34, 98), 38, (39, 84), 40, 53, 54, 55, 76, 78, 85, 87, 91, 99, 101, 102, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 109, 115, 116

- Rogue comment – data type for driftTrackingTlvSupport: 132