P802.1ASdm/D1.0
Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for WG Ballot

Version 8

Geoffrey M. Garner
Analog Devices, Inc. (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG

2023.05.19

Ballot Statistics – 1

☐Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	28	66.66
No (voters)	14	33.33
Voting Yes or No	42	100
Abstain Time	2	
Abstain Expertise	11	
Abstain Total	13	23.64
Respondents (who are voting members)	55	75.34
Voting Members	73	100
Non-voting member commenters	0	

Ballot Statistics

❑Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Number of Commenters	19	34.55 (percentage of voters responding)
Number of Comments	160	100.00
TR	71	48.97
T	11	6.21
ER	37	21.38
E	41	23.45

Comments by Category - 1

❑In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together

❑Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (36 comments)

- 4, 130, 5, (49, 102, 151), 60, 26, 7, 56, (104, 153) 105, (73, 89), (107, 159) 109, 110, 40, 31, 93, 113, (94, 142, 160), 95, 82, (98, 99), 145, 138, (146, 147, 148, 149)

❑The comments on the following pages are considered to be non-trivial (124 comments)

- Note that some of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial

- Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

Comments by Category - 2

❑Comments to be discussed (124 comments; grouped comments are shown in parentheses):

- PAR Revision: 9, 43, 141

- Inclusion of 802.1ASdr: 3, 144, (58, 59)

- Use of the term "Explicit": 11, 41

- Referencing IEEE 1588 and ITU-T G.781.1: (47, 48), (6, 45, 46, 101, 121)

- Use of the term "default" and BMCA requirements: 10, 50, 52, 71, 143

- Support of Signaling messages: 69, 70, 88

- SyncIntervalSetting state machine optional: 53, 61

- Domain 0 optional: 72, 75, 103

- Figure 7-3: (62, 64, 65, 66)

- NOTES in figures: 51, 55, 57, 63, 67, 68

- Sending Announce immediately after PTP Port state change or receipt of Announce, in external port configuration: 42

- Ranges for timeouts: 36, 126

- Use of PTP Instance states when hot standby is not implemented: 1, 77, 78, 79, 92, 108, 112

Comments by Category - 3

❑ Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

▪ HotStandbySystemLogSyncTimeThreshold1 and 2: 96, 97

▪ Subclause 17.1: 131, 132, 22, 133, 134, 135, 23, 32, 33, 90

▪ Subclause 17.2: (136, 139), (24, 25), 137, 83, 91, 116, 117, 140

▪ Description needed for why hot standby is an improvement over BMCA with respect to flapping: 13

▪ Timeframe for supplying YANG module: 38

▪ "Timing" versus "Timing information": 154

▪ Miscellaneous: 128, 129, (54, 27, 28, 2, 29), (14, 15), (18, 16, 21, 17, 118, 20, 19), (8, 156), (106, 155, 157) 74, 76, 80, 30, 37, 81, (35, 127), 12, 111, (44, 150) 39, 114, 115, 34, 119, 100, 120, 125, 123, 87, 124, 86, 84, 85, 122, 152, 158