

# P802.1ASdm/D1.0 Editor's Report

## Proposed Comment Resolution for WG Ballot

### Version 0

**Geoffrey M. Garner**  
**Analog Devices, Inc. (Consultant)**

**[gmgarner@alum.mit.edu](mailto:gmgarner@alum.mit.edu)**

*IEEE 802.1 TSN TG*  
2023.03.13

# Ballot Statistics

---

- ❑ Full ballot statistics will be provided in the next version of the Editor's Report
  - There were a total of 145 comments, from 17 commenters
  - The approval rate was 60% (18 Approve, 12 Disapprove)

# Comments by Category - 1

---

- ❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together
- ❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (28 comments)
  - All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them (they will be left in proposed mode for an adequate time period for participants to review them)
    - 4, 130, 5, (49, 102), 60, 26, 7, 56, 104, 105, (73, 89), 107, 109, 110, 40, 31, 93, 113, (94, 142), 95, 82, (98, 99), 145, 138
- ❑ The comments on the following pages will be discussed (117 comments)
  - Note that some of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)
  - Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

# Comments by Category - 2

---

☐ Comments to be discussed (117 comments; grouped comments are shown in parentheses):

- PAR Revision: 9, 43, 141
- Inclusion of 802.1ASdr: 3, 144, (58, 59)
- Use of the term “Explicit”: 11, 41
- Referencing IEEE 1588 and ITU-T G.781.1: (47, 48), (6, 45, 46, 101, 121)
- Use of the term “default” and BMCA requirements: 10, 50, 52, 71, 143
- Support of Signaling messages: 69, 70, 88
- SyncIntervalSetting state machine optional: 53, 61
- Domain 0 optional: 72, 75, 103
- Figure 7-3: (62, 64, 65, 66)
- NOTES in figures: 51, 55, 57, 63, 67, 68
- Sending Announce immediately after PTP Port state change or receipt of Announce, in external port configuration: 42
- Ranges for timeouts: 36, 126
- Use of PTP Instance states when hot standby is not implemented: 1, 77, 78, 79, 92, 108, 112

# Comments by Category - 3

---

## □ Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- HotStandbySystemLogSyncTimeThreshold1 and 2: 96, 97
- Subclause 17.1: 131, 132, 22, 133, 134, 135, 23, 32, 33, 90
- Subclause 17.2: (136, 139), (24, 25), 137, 83, 91, 116, 117, 140
- Description needed for why hot standby is an improvement over BMCA with respect to flapping: 13
- Timeframe for supplying YANG module: 38
- Miscellaneous: 128, 129, (54, 27, 128), (14, 15), 28, 29, (18, 16, 21, 17, 20, 19), 8, 106, 74, 76, 80, 30, 37, 81, (35, 127), 12, 111, 44, 39, 114, 115, 118, 34, 119, 100, 120, 125, 123, 87, 124, 86, 84, 85, 122