

[June 21, 2023]

ETHERNOVIA

P802.1DG D2.0
Editors Report V03

Contribution to:  IEEE

Response Statistics

D1.4

CATEGORY	All respondents	
	TOTAL	%
Yes	5	31.2
No	11	68.8
Voting Yes or No	16	44.4
Abs. Time	10	27.8
Abs. Expertise	10	27.8
Abs. Other	0	0.0
Respondents	36	100
Voting members		
Non-voting commenters		
No. of commenters	13	36.1
No. of comments	540	100
TR	132	24.4
T	16	2.9
ER	311	57.6

D2.0

CATEGORY§	All respondents§	
	TOTAL§	%§
Yes§	13§	56.5§
No§	10§	43.5§
Voting Yes or No§	23§	59.0§
Abs. Time§	5§	12.8§
Abs. Expertise§	7§	17.9§
Abs. Other§	4§	10.3§
Respondents§	39§	100§
Voting members§	§	§
Non-voting commenters§	§	§
No. of commenters§	19§	48.7§
No. of comments§	189§	100§
TR§	56§	29.6§
T§	11§	12.7§
ER§	63§	33.3§

+1 rogue comment

I included some late ballots, not listed in:
https://standards.caot.ict.ericsson.net/ethernet/web_tally/05f46.html

What will NOT go to WG discussion

- Simple editorial (typos, formalities, capitalization, formatting, ...)
- Comments on Clause 0 as it will be removed before publication
 - should previous draft editorial notes be removed for every draft to avoid confusion?
- Resolved without WG discussion:
 - 1, 5, 18, 27, 17, 160, 36, 19, 49, 61, 93, 88, 79, 73, 71, 69, 46, 60, 55, 45, 39, 116, 109, 110, 112, 115, 119, 120, 121, 114, 113, 10, 43, 22, 21, 20, 16, 142, 136, 141, 143, 144, 101, 149, 124, 125, 127
 - Please object if you disagree!

AUTOSAR

- There are 3 technical options:
 - “copy” IEEE Std 802.1AS + ASdm - conflicts with:
<https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dg-Nomura-JASPAR-Use-Cases-coexistence-0323-v07.pdf>
 - “copy” AUTOSAR specification - exact (legal) implications are unknown and may be difficult to resolve
 - create a “3rd new” Profile - this is utterly undesirable!
- Postpone a more detailed discussion to F2F Plenary in Berlin!

Changes to the PAR?

- Comments 14, 84
 - Where must the PAR be quoted? (1.2?)
 - Reduction in scope should not be a reason to change the PAR
- Comment 85
 - Adapt the Introduction (1.3) to outline reduced scope from the PAR

Past Comments and Contributions

- Comment 147: “The comment resolution of many comments was not applied to the draft.”
- PROPOSED REJECT:
Please list out which comments were not implemented considering the contributions since, as they may have outdated those comments.
 - <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dg-turner-text-contribution-1D5-0323-v01.pdf>
 - <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dg-turner-finn-profile-commented-0223-v01.pdf>
 - <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dg-turner-update-0123-v01.pdf>
 - <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2022/dg-turner-update-1122-v01.pdf>
 - <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2022/dg-turner-ModuleProfiles-0422-v02.pdf>

Technical discussion

- max. SDU size
 - comments 95, 161, 6, 190
- 7. Congestion Isolation
 - Comments 153, 38
- VLAN Support
 - Comments 7, 148, 30, 51, 59, 157, 58, 156
- Shaper Combinations
 - Comments 150, 26, 74 (email), 28, 152
- 5.6 Conformance Module Ingress Selection (CM-IS)
 - Comments 91, 92, 94,

Resolved comments

- 2023-06-20: 14, 84, 85, 147, 95, 161, 6, 190, 153, 38, 7



Max Turner

Utrechtseweg 75
NL-3702AA Zeist
The Netherlands


+49 177 863 7804

max.turner@ethernovia.com



ETHERNOVIA

Thank You
for your attention!

Contribution to:  IEEE