

# Comments on IEEE P802.19.3a PAR & CSD

From IEEE 802.1

These comments are on the PAR and CSD found in:

- <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/23/19-23-0017-02-0000-19-3a-par-draft.pdf>
- <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/23/19-23-0018-02-0000-802-19-3a-csd-draft.doc>

# PAR

## *4.3 Projected Completion Date for Submittal to RevCom*

- No date is provided.
  - Provide one.

## PAR

### 5.2.b *Scope of the project*

- Editorial: The first sentence needlessly uses “address” twice.
  - Delete the second occurrence.
- The second sentence and subsequent sentences in the rest of the PAR use “project” (in 5.2.b, and 5.5), and the future tense (in 5.2.b, 5.4, 5.5, and 8.1).
  - Change “project” to “amendment” and, except perhaps in the third sentence of 5.5, use the present tense in the listed sections of the PAR.
- The last sentence uses “revision”; however, IEEE Std 802.19.3-2021 was not a revision.
  - Change “revision” to “edition”.

## PAR

### 5.5 *Need for the project*

- Editorial: The last sentence of the second paragraph needlessly uses “with each other” following “coexist” and uses “is critical” for two subjects.
  - Delete “with each other”, and change “is” to “are”.
- The second sentence of the third paragraph uses “incorporating”, which may be interpreted as supporting content duplication.
  - Change “incorporating” to “based on”.
- Editorial: The last sentence of the third paragraph uses “recompensates”.
  - Change “recompensates” to “recommendations”.
- The last sentence of the fourth paragraph uses “users of this standard”.
  - Change “users of this standard” to “users of this recommended practice”.
- Editorials: The last paragraph uses “referenced standards”, which could be clearer.
  - Insert “(the referenced standards)” after “IEEE Std 802.15.4 and IEEE Std 802.11ah-2016”.

# PAR

## *8.1 Additional Explanatory Notes*

- 5.2 does not indicate that the recommended practice will cite IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020.
  - Change “As indicated in 5.2, the” to “#5.2.b: The”
- Editorial: The titles of IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020 are not provided.
  - Provide their titles.

# CSD

## 1.1.2 *Coexistence*

- Editorial: “the referenced standards” could be clearer.
  - Change to “IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020 (the referenced standards)”.

## 1.2.1 *Broad market potential*

- Editorial: “IEEE Std 802.1-2020” is in error.
  - Change to “IEEE Std 802.11-2020”.

## CSD

### 1.2.2.b *Compatibility*

- IEEE 802.15 has previously determined that IEEE Std 802.15.4ab shall comply with IEEE Std 802 but cannot comply with IEEE Std 802.1Q and IEEE Std 802.1AC because IEEE Std 802.15 uses 64-bit MAC addresses. That is one aspect; however, IEEE 802.1 believes the following aspects also apply:
  - IEEE Std 802.15.4 has a restricted MTU size which makes bridging to other IEEE 802 media impossible without suitable fragmentation/reassembly support.
  - The use of other Addressing Modes beyond the extended address (64-bit) is also incompatible with IEEE Std 802.1Q and IEEE Std 802.1AC.

Please consider including these aspects as well as any others that may be appropriate in your response on IEEE Std 802.15.4 aspects that do not comply with IEEE Std 802.1Q and IEEE Std 802.1AC.



# CSD

## 1.2.4a *Demonstrated system feasibility*

- Editorial: The third sentence uses “standard”.
  - Change to “Recommended Practice”.

## 1.2.5.a *Known cost factors.*

- Editorial: The first sentence inconsistently uses “subject”.
  - Change to “referenced”.

## 1.2.5.d *Consideration of operational costs (e.g., energy consumption).*

- Editorial: The sentence uses “operating”.
  - Change to “operational”.