

Comments on IEEE P802.19.3a PAR & CSD

From IEEE 802.1

These comments are on the PAR and CSD found in:

- <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/23/19-23-0017-02-0000-19-3a-par-draft.pdf>
- <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/23/19-23-0018-02-0000-802-19-3a-csd-draft.doc>

PAR

4.3 Projected Completion Date for Submittal to RevCom

- No date is provided.
 - Provide one.

PAR

5.2.b *Scope of the project*

- Editorial: The first sentence needlessly uses “address” twice.
 - Delete the second occurrence.
- The second sentence and subsequent sentences in the rest of the PAR use “project” (in 5.2.b, and 5.5), and the future tense (in 5.2.b, 5.4, 5.5, and 8.1).
 - Change “project” to “amendment” and, except perhaps in the third sentence of 5.5, use the present tense in the listed sections of the PAR.
- The last sentence uses “revision”; however, IEEE Std 802.19.3-2021 was not a revision.
 - Change “revision” to “edition”.

PAR

5.5 *Need for the project*

- Editorial: The last sentence of the second paragraph needlessly uses “with each other” following “coexist” and uses “is critical” for two subjects.
 - Delete “with each other”, and change “is” to “are”.
- The second sentence of the third paragraph uses “incorporating”, which may be interpreted as supporting content duplication.
 - Change “incorporating” to “based on”.
- Editorial: The last sentence of the third paragraph uses “recompensates”.
 - Change “recompensates” to “recommendations”.
- The last sentence of the fourth paragraph uses “users of this standard”.
 - Change “users of this standard” to “users of this recommended practice”.
- Editorials: The last paragraph uses “referenced standards”, which could be clearer.
 - Insert “(the referenced standards)” after “IEEE Std 802.15.4 and IEEE Std 802.11ah-2016”.

PAR

8.1 Additional Explanatory Notes

- 5.2 does not indicate that the recommended practice will cite IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020.
 - Change “As indicated in 5.2, the” to “#5.2.b: The”
- Editorial: The titles of IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020 are not provided.
 - Provide their titles.

CSD

1.1.2 *Coexistence*

- Editorial: “the referenced standards” could be clearer.
 - Change to “IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020 (the referenced standards)”.

1.2.1 *Broad market potential*

- Editorial: “IEEE Std 802.1-2020” is in error.
 - Change to “IEEE Std 802.11-2020”.

1.2.2 *Compatibility*

- Recheck 1.2.2.b

CSD

1.2.4a *Demonstrated system feasibility*

- Editorial: The third sentence uses “standard”.
 - Change to “Recommended Practice”.

1.2.5.a *Known cost factors.*

- Editorial: The first sentence inconsistently uses “subject”.
 - Change to “referenced”.

1.2.5.d *Consideration of operational costs (e.g., energy consumption).*

- Editorial: The sentence uses “operating”.
 - Change to “operational”.