This provides responses to comments ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 ballot of IEEE Std 802.1BA-2021

The voting results on IEEE Std 802.1BA-2021:
- Support need for ISO standard? Passed 8/0/11
- Support this submission being sent to FDIS? 7/1/11
- 1 comment with the China NB NO vote.

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606. This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to the comments by China NB on this ballot.

China NB comment 1 on IEEE Std 802.1BA-2021:

IEEE 802.1Q (which references IEEE 802.1X technology) is the normative reference of this proposal (chapters 1 to 7). China NB has voted against IEEE 802.1Q for several times and the comments about IEEE 802.1Q can be found in 6N17175.

Proposed Change:

Resolve the technical flaws (security problems) of the referenced standard.

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE Std 802.1BA-2021:

Comments on IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018 (approved as ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2020 (Ed 2)) are beyond the scope of IEEE Std 802.1BA-2021. IEEE Std 802.1BA-2021 defines profiles that select features, options, configurations, defaults, protocols, and procedures of bridges, stations, and Local Area Networks (LANs) that are necessary to build networks that are capable of transporting time-sensitive audio and/or video data streams.

Additionally, as was stated in prior responses to ballot comments from China NB, IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2020) explains how it can be used in conjunction with IEEE Std 802.1X-2020 (approved as ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2021). IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018 is not based on nor does it depend on the use of IEEE Std 802.1X-2020. It is provided as an illustrative example to provide additional security through port-based network access control. Specifically, IEEE Std 802.1X may be used to provide a further level of control over the connectivity provided by a Bridge Port to the MAC Relay Entity and the Higher Layer Entities within a Bridge.

Furthermore, IEEE 802 believes that none of the alleged security problems asserted by the China NB have been shown to be valid. In spite of numerous communications and requests for further technical information about the vague claims of "security problems" in IEEE 802 security standards since 2013, the China NB has been unable to substantiate their assertions. The history of the security technology discussion can be found in documents SC6N17493 and SC6N17741

Without technical substantiation of any related concerns, IEEE 802 cannot consider modification of the existing IEEE 802 or ISO standards.