This provides responses to comments received on the JTC1 ballot of IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1Q/Ed 2).

The voting results on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1Q/Ed 2) in 6N17175.
- – Passed 10/1/9
- – 1 comment received with the China NB NO vote

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606. This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to the comments by China NB on this ballot.

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1Q/Ed 2)
ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1Q (Ed 2), which is IEEE 802.1Q-2018, has incorporated IEEE 802.1Q-2014 and its 7 amendments and 1 corrigendum.
Regarding IEEE 802.1Q^{TM}-2014 project, China NB has already submitted the comments during its 60-day ballot and FDIS ballot against the references to IEEE 802.1X, which has security problems including lack of specifications on pre-established trusted channel which IEEE 802.1X security is relying on, failing to achieve a real mutual authentication between the Supplicant and Authenticator, lack of independent identity for Authenticator resulting in losing the basic credential of identity legitimacy, etc.
However, there is no further steps taken in this new 2018 version to resolve those comments. IEEE 802.1X is still the normative reference in IEEE 802.1Q-2018 and IEEE 802.1X is used in Clause 8.13.9, 10.1, 25.2 etc.
The reply in 6N16943 has been noted. However, the response did not solve the security concerns about IEEE 802.1Q.
Therefore, China NB cannot support the publication of IEEE 802.1Q-2018.

Proposed change:

(NONE)

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1Q/Ed 2):

IEEE 802.1Q-2018 is the revision to IEEE 802.1Q-2014 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016) incorporating the approved amendments to the base standard.

As was stated in the earlier responses to the IEEE Std 802.1Q-2014 ballot comments from China NB, IEEE Std 802.1Q explains how it can be used in conjunction with IEEE Std 802.1X (approved as ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2013). IEEE Std 802.1Q is not based on nor does it depend on the use of IEEE Std 802.1X-2010. It is provided as an illustrative example to provide additional security through port-based network access control. Specifically, IEEE 802.1X may be used to provide a further level of control over the connectivity provided by a Bridge Port to the MAC Relay Entity and the Higher Layer Entities within a Bridge. It is unnecessary to remove the IEEE 802.1X-2010-related descriptions and reference from the text.

We also refer China NB to our previous rebuttals of similar claims of defects in IEEE Std 802.1X-2010 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2013).