P802.1DG/D1.2 Editor's Report for Ballot Comment Resolution (v0)

by: Craig Gunther

Craig Gunther Consulting

P802.1DG/D1.2 Summary

The focus of D1.2 was to introduce profiles and move all tutorial/educational information to informative to Annex E. THANKS TO ALL WHO SUBMITTED COMMENTS! The Editor has one request for commenters new to the 802.1 ballot process: Be sure to include sub-clause numbers (column C) in your comment spreadsheet. One of the techniques for addressing comments is to group them by clause which doesn't work without the sub-clause numbers.

This document sorts comments into discussion topics for ease of comment resolution. The Editor has made a best effort to organize the comments by CommentType (E, ER, T, TR, etc). In case of errors, the comment resolution database is the definitive source.

In those places where comments are grouped together (i.e. enclosed in []), they have been put into the category that is the best fit for that group.

Ballot Statistics

CATEGORY	TOTAL	%
Yes	10	37
No	17	63
Voting Yes or No	27	68
Abs. Time	7	18
Abs. Expertise	5	13
Abs. Other	1	3
Respondents	27	100
Voting members		
Non-voting commenters		
No. of commenters	27	100
No. of comments	148	100
TR	78	53
T	18	12
ER	36	24
E	16	11

Ballot Comments NOT planned for discussion

These comments will be accepted as-is, or with changes similar in nature to what was in the Suggested Remedy. No discussion is anticipated unless someone requests it.

Clarification/readability/typos:

- "TR" ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 67, 93

- "ER" ACCEPT: 63, 135

- "E" ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 134

Ballot Comments not yet addressed

Due to Editor's time constraints the following comments have not been reviewed yet. They will be reviewed and moved into the correct categories before the next call.

- 9-12 (Maik)
- 17-32, 34-35 (Geoff)
- 36-39, 42-43 (Jingfei)
- 46 (Silvana)
- 55-60, 66, 71-73 (Adhijit)
- 74-84 (Venkat)
- 95-119 (Don)

Ballot Comments with proposed resolutions that have not been categorized yet

Due to Editor's time constraints the following comments have been reviewed but have not been categorized yet. They will be categorized before the next call.

- 69-70 (Adhijit)
- 85-89, 91-92 (Don)
- 125, [126,137], 128-130, 133, 136, 139, 146 (Helge)

Ballot Comments that were Rejected-1

802.1CB

- 65

PAR Modifications

- 47, 138

PAR Scope

- 50, 53

Cut-through

- 52

Tutorial (Annex E)

- 64

Ballot Comments that were Rejected-2

General

- 61

Ballot Comments for concepts

Trusted vs Untrusted, gateway

- "TR" DISCUSS: [7,8,120]

- "E" DISCUSS: 147

Terms, definitions, wording, clarification

- "TR" ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 3, 4, [14,121], [16,90], 40

- "ER" DISCUSS: 132, 140-145

- "ER" ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 1, [15,122], 44, [45,141], 48, 49

- "E" DISCUSS: 124, 131

- "E" ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 123, 127, 148

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1AS)

802.1AS Reliability:

- "TR" ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [6,51]
- "ER" ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [13,41]

802.1AS Requirements

- "TR" ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 33

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1CB)

802.1CB Compound Streams:

- "TR" ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 68*

Ballot Comments for discussion (general topics)

PAR Scope:

- "TR" DISCUSS: 54

Bibliography:

- "E" ACCEPT IN PRONCIPLE: 62

Thank you!