Proposal to Send Liaison to ITU-T SG 15, Q13 to request G.781.1 for Clock Mode Definitions

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2020.03.16

Outline

❑Recap of Comment #406 against 60802/D1.1 and subsequent discussions

❑Next steps

❑Proposal to send Liaison to ITU-T SG 15, Q13, to request G.781.1 draft, which contains definitions of clock modes and respective state transition diagram

Recap of Comment #406 against 60802/D1.1

❑ Comment #406 against 60802/D1.1

- SC 5.1.4, p.21, Line 885

    - The relevant sentence in the draft reads:

    The status is given by the state of the application clock, i.e., "arbitrary", "free running", and "in synch").

    - The comment is:

    Comment: The sentence refers to the state of the end application clock, and the example states "arbitrary", "free-running", and "in sync" are given. But, the states are not defined anywhere. Also, it is not clear what the difference between "arbitrary" and "free-running" is. Finally, is a state "holdover" needed?

    Suggested Remedy: Define all the application clock states. Add "holdover" if needed.

    Response: ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Commenter will provide a proposed set of definitions. The holdover state will not be included.

Recap of Discussion of Comment #406

❑ In the discussion of comment #406 at the November 2019 802.1 Joint IEC/IEEE 60802 meeting, the commenter indicated that a set of clock states, and a corresponding state transition diagram, have been proposed and added to the draft of ITU-T New Rec. G.781.1 [1]

❑ It was indicated during the discussion that it would be useful to see the G.781.1 definitions and state transition diagram

❑ A presentation [2] was given at the January 2020 IEC/IEEE 60802 meeting, which provided the clock mode definitions and associated state transition diagram

  ▪ The presentation is an informal liaison from one of the co-editors of G.781.1, who was also the author of [2]

❑ It was noted in the presentation that G.781.1 [1] is a draft; until the Recommendation is approved, there can be modifications

  ▪ But it also was noted that it does appear that the definitions are currently stable

Recap of Discussion of Comment #406

❑As a result of the discussion of [2], it was indicated that the clock mode definitions and state transition diagram of G.781.1 would be a good starting point for the IEC/IEEE 60802 profile document

❑Based on the above, the author (of both [2] and the current presentation) agreed to find out what would be needed (in terms of appropriate permissions) to use the definitions and related figures and text of G.781.1

Next Steps – 1

❑ The following was determined, based on offline discussions with individuals in ITU-T and 802.1

- ▪ Rather than copying text from an ITU-T Recommendation into an IEEE Standard, it is highly preferable to reference the ITU-T Recommendation and indicate any changes needed for the IEEE Standard
  - • Note that pdf versions of ITU-T Recommendations are available free of charge within a short time after publication (possibly six months?); this means that availability of G.781.1 would not be an issue
- ▪ Notwithstanding the above, it is possible to obtain permission to copy text from an ITU-T Recommendation if that really is necessary
  - • To obtain permission to do this, the appropriate entity in IEEE would need to send a letter to the SG 15 leadership and request permission
    - – The letter should indicate exactly what text is desired to be copied
    - – Permission would be needed before the text could be included in the IEEE draft, as well as for inclusion in the published standard

Next steps – 2

❑ Based on the above it is proposed that, at least going forward for the next draft of the IEC/IEEE 60802 profile document, that the relevant clauses/subclauses/figures/tables of G.781.1 be referenced rather than copied, with any changes needed for the IEC/IEEE 60802 profile document indicated in that document

- ▪ 802.1 members are free to comment on this in the next ballot if they prefer otherwise

❑ However, since G.781.1 is still a draft, it is not publicly available

❑ To facilitate referencing the relevant text in G.781.1, 802.1 members need access to G.781.1

❑ It therefore will be proposed that 802.1 send a liaison to ITU-T SG 15, Q13, to:

- ▪ Indicate that 802.1 is interested in referencing some of the text in G.781.1

- ▪ request a copy of the latest draft of G.781.1 or, at least, the relevant clauses/subclauses that contain the clock mode definitions and associated state transition diagram

- ▪ Inquire what the schedule is for approval

- ▪ Inquire as to how stable the definitions are

Next steps - 3

❑ Once the document (or relevant portions of the document) are obtained by 802.1, the IEC/IEEE 60802 editor can incorporate text into the profile document that references the relevant portion(s) of G.781.1 and indicates any needed changes

❑ Note that the planned date for approval of G.781.1 is in 2021 (this is taken from the updated work program published at the end of the January 27 – February 7, 2020 ITU-T SG 15 meeting

▪ The month is not given because this is in the next study period, and the meeting dates have not yet been decided

▪ In any case, in addition to requesting the draft, the liaison should ask Q13/15 when G.781.1 is planned to be consented (to confirm this)

Proposal

❑ It is proposed that 802.1 send a liaison to SG 15, Q13, to

- ▪ Indicate that 802.1 is interested in referencing some of the text in G.781.1

- ▪ request a copy of the latest draft of G.781.1 or, at least, the relevant clauses/subclauses that contain the clock mode definitions and associated state transition diagram

- ▪ Inquire what the schedule is for approval

- ▪ Inquire as to how stable the definitions are

❑ The author of this presentation has prepared a draft of a liaison, which could be used as a starting point

References

[1] ITU-T New Draft Rec. G.781.1, latest draft, *Synchronization layer functions for packet-based synchronization*, ITU-T, Geneva, January/February 2020, TD469(WP3).

[2] Geoffrey M. Garner, Input for Comment #406 Against 60802/D1.1, presentation to IEC/IEEE 60802 meeting, Informal liaison from G.781.1 co-editor, Geneva, January 2020, available at http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/liaisons/60802-garner-input-related-to-comment-406-against-d1-1-0120-v01.pdf.

Thank you