Rebuttal Comments from 802.11

with responses from 802.1

P802.1CBcv PAR & CSD with 802.1 comment responses

Comments on the PAR for P802.1CBcv - Amendment: Information Model, YANG Data Model and Management Information Base Module were received from 802.11 and 802.3.

The responses to the comment are here:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cv-PAR-CSD-comments-0717-v01.pdf

The PAR has been updated:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cv-draft-PAR-0517-v02.pdf

The CSD has been updated:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cv-draft-CSD-0517-v02.pdf

Rebuttal to 802.1CBcv response

5 – PAR 6.1b – The citing of IEEE 802d requires that the full standard be listed in 8.1, as well as IEEE std. 802. Also "RA" , "OID" and "URN" acronyms need to be spelled out on first usage as well.

6 – CSD 1.2.5 – In the beginning of the CSD, there is discussion of MIB and YANG models, but in the new text in 1.2.5, there seems to be a change to YANG and SNMP (transport of the MIB), should this section be referring to the impact of the MIB. If Not, then you should also include a reference for SNMP.

Rebuttal to 802.1CBcv response

Response:
    The WG has considered the rebuttals and has decided to defer progression of this PAR until a future meeting to allow further development of the PAR and CSD.

P802.1Qcw PAR & CSD with 802.1 comment responses

Comments on the PAR for P802.1Qcw - Amendment: YANG Data Models for Scheduled Traffic, Frame Preemption, and Per-Stream Filtering and Policing were received from 802.11 and 802.3.

The responses to the comment are here:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cw-PAR-CSD-comments-0717-v01.pdf

The PAR has been updated:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cw-draft-PAR-0517-v02.pdf

The CSD has been updated:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cw-draft-CSD-0517-v02.pdf

Rebuttal to 802.1Qcw

1. **PAR 5.2.b (project scope)**

   – the addition of the "Additionally, this amendment will address errors or omissions to existing features related to the aforementioned clauses as approved by the 802.1 maintenance process."

   The "IEEE 802.1 maintenance process" does not have a PAR, so it is not an authorized Activity. The purpose each of the 802.1 maintenance PARs should authorize the specific activity that is proposed.

   Accept: delete "as approved by the 802.1 maintenance process".

Rebuttal to 802.1Qcw

2. PAR 5.3

– "If yes, please explain" – listing the title of another amendment does not seem to "explain".

- How is the proposed standard dependent on IEEE P802.1Q-Rev and IEEE P802.1Qcp?
- What is the schedule impact due to the dependency on IEEE P802.1Q-Rev and IEEE P802.1Qcp?

Response:

The schedule of P802.1Qcw takes the dependencies into account.

5.3 updated to: "P802.1Qcw builds upon the YANG Data Model being specified by IEEE P802.1Qcp, which cannot be approved until the maintenance revision of IEEE P802.1Q is approved.

Rebuttal to 802.1Qcw

3 PAR – 6.1b – "The YANG Data Model will be assigned a URN based on the RA URN tutorial and IEEE Std 802d."

    a)   The acronyms need to be expanded "URN", "RA"

    b)   The RA URN tutorial should include a reference.

    c)   IEEE Std 802d should be fully cited in 8.1

Response:
Fix abbreviations.

P802.1Qcx PAR & CSD with 802.1 comment responses

Comments on the PAR for P802.1Qcx - Amendment: YANG Data Model for Connectivity Fault Management were received from 802.11 and 802.3.

The responses to the comment are here:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cx-PAR-CSD-comments-0717-v01.pdf

The PAR has been updated:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cx-draft-PAR-0517-v02.pdf

The CSD has been updated:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cx-draft-CSD-0517-v02.pdf

Rebuttal to 802.1Qcx

1. **PAR 5.3**

    – "If yes, please explain" – listing the title of another amendment does not seem to "explain".

    -   How is the proposed standard dependent on IEEE P802.1Q-Rev and IEEE P802.1Qcp?
    -   What is the schedule impact due to the dependency on IEEE P802.1Q-Rev and IEEE P802.1Qcp?

    Response:

    The schedule of P802.1Qcx takes the dependencies into account.

    5.3 updated to: "P802.1Qcx builds upon the YANG Data Model being specified by IEEE P802.1Qcp, which cannot be approved until the maintenance revision of IEEE P802.1Q is approved.

Rebuttal to 802.1Qcx

2. PAR – 6.1b – "The YANG Data Model will be assigned a URN based on the RA URN tutorial and IEEE Std 802d."

  a)   The acronyms need to be expanded "URN", "RA"

  b)   The RA URN tutorial should include a reference.

  c)   IEEE Std 802d should be fully cited in 8.1

Response:
Fix abbreviations.

P802.1AS-rev PAR with 802.1 comment responses

Comments on the PAR for P802.1AS-Rev - Timing and Synchronization for Time-Sensitive
 Applications were received from 802.11 and 802.3.

The responses to the comment are here:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/as-rev-PAR-modification-comments-0717-v01.pdf

The PAR Modification Request has been updated:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/as-rev-PAR-modification-0517-v02.pdf

Rebuttal to 802.1ASrev response

2. PAR 6.1b – The explanation text seems to imply a review is not necessary.

Suggested Explanation Text:

"RAC should review the use of registry terms that appear in the document (e.g., OUI, Ethertype, EUI-64, EUI-48 and text suggesting using a mapping from EUI-48 to EUI-64 that is now deprecated because it potentially creates duplicate EUI-64 addresses)."

Also include the acronym expansion for "EUI", "OUI".

Response:

The explanation that was added is from the RAC Chair. The explanation is clear to two additional RAC members. Therefore, there is no need to make further changes to the explanation of 6.1.b.

Unresolved acronyms can be resolved via editorial process by the 802.1 WG Chair.

P802.1ABcu PAR & CSD with 802.1 comment responses

Comments on the PAR for P802.1ABcu - Amendment: LLDP YANG Data Model were received from 802.11 and 802.3.

The responses to the comment are here:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cu-PAR-CSD-comments-0717-v01.pdf

The PAR has been updated:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cu-draft-PAR-0517-v02.pdf

The updated CSD:
http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/cu-draft-CSD-0517-v02.pdf

Rebuttal to 802.1ABcu

1. PAR 5.2.b (project scope)

– the addition of the "Additionally, this amendment will address errors or omissions to existing features related to the aforementioned clauses as approved by the 802.1 maintenance process."

The "IEEE 802.1 maintenance process" does not have a PAR, so it is not an authorized Activity. The purpose each of the 802.1 maintenance PARs should authorize the specific activity that is proposed.

Response:
Accept: delete "as approved by the 802.1 maintenance process".

Rebuttal to 802.1ABcu

2. PAR – 6.1b – "The YANG Data Model will be assigned a URN based on the RA URN tutorial and IEEE Std 802d."

a) The acronyms need to be expanded "URN", "RA"

b) The RA URN tutorial should include a reference.

c) IEEE Std 802d should be fully cited in 8.1

Response:
Fix abbreviations.

P802.1AE PAR & CSD with 802.1 comment responses

Comments on the P802.1AE PAR were received from 802.11 and 802.3.

The responses to the comment are here:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/ae-rev-par-response-to-comments-0717-v01.txt

The PAR has been updated:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2017/ae-seaman-rev-draft-par0717-v04.pdf

Rebuttal to P802.1AE

1. PAR 6.1.b. Explanation: "RAC review of previously reviewed text is appropriate to assure terminology and descriptions of usage are correct."

   Suggested replacement: "RAC should review the use of registry terms that appear in the document."

Response:
The explanation that was added is from the RAC Chair. The explanation was clear to two additional RAC members. Therefore, there is no need to make further changes to the explanation of 6.1.b.