

# WHOIS1 Rec #5-9: Data Accuracy

## ★Objective

*Consistent with ICANN's mission and Bylaws, Section 4.6(e)(iv), the Review Team will (a) evaluate the extent to which ICANN Org has implemented each prior Directory Service Review recommendation (noting differences if any between recommended and implemented steps), (b) assess to the degree practical the extent to which implementation of each recommendation was effective in addressing the issue identified by the prior RT or generated additional information useful to management and evolution of WHOIS (RDS), and (c) determine if any specific measurable steps should be recommended to enhance results achieved through the prior RT's recommendations. This includes developing a framework to measure and assess the effectiveness of recommendations, and applying that approach to all areas of WHOIS originally assessed by the prior RT (as applicable).*

RT1 Recommendations to be assessed by this subgroup:

*Recommendations #5, 6, 7, 8, 9 - Data Accuracy*

## Background Documents

- WHOIS1 Implementation Briefings on Recommendations 1, 2, 3, 6, 7, 9, 15, 16: [PPT](#), [PDF](#)
- WHOIS1 Implementation Briefings on Recommendations 5, 8, 10, 11: [PPT](#), [PDF](#)
- [Answers to RDS-WHOIS2 Questions on Implementation Briefings](#)
- [WHOIS Review Team \(WHOIS1\) Final Report \(2012\) and Action Plan](#)
- [WHOIS Review Team \(WHOIS1\) Implementation Reports](#), including
  - [Executive Summary of Implementation Report](#)
  - [Detailed implementation Report](#)
- Documents cited in briefing on Recommendations 5-9 include
  - [WHOIS Informational Microsite](#)
  - [WHOIS ARS December 2015 report, webinar presentation and recording](#)
  - [WHOIS ARS June 2016 report, webinar presentation and recording](#)
  - [WHOIS ARS December 2016 report, webinar presentation and recording](#)
  - [WHOIS ARS June 2017 report, webinar presentation and recording](#)
  - [WHOIS ARS Compliance Metrics](#)
  - [WHOIS ARS Validation Criteria](#)
  - [Registrant's Benefits and Responsibilities](#)
  - [Registrant Educational Series](#)
  - [2014 New gTLD Registry Agreement, including Specification 4 Registration Data Publication Services](#)
  - [SAC058, Report on Domain Name Registration Data Validation](#)
- Additional links specific to Recommendation 7:
  - [2013 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [2014 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [2015 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [2016 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [Contractual Compliance 2015 Annual Report](#)
- Additional links specific to Recommendation 9:

★Leader/Rapporteur: Lili Sun

★Members: Cathrin Bauer-Bulst, Dmitry Belyavsky, Lili Sun, Erika Mann

★Mailing-list archives: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/rds-whois2-dataaccuracy/>

★Conference calls: see [here](#)

★Review Team Templates: see [here](#)

## Subgroup Documents

Date	Document (Versions in Red are latest)	File
Subgroup Report		
05 Aug 2018	<b>v6</b>	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
30 Jul 2018	v5 (incl. FtoF #3 Agreements)	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
11 Jun 2018	v4	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
25 May 2018	v3	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
04 Apr 2018	v2	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
01 Apr 2018	v1	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
Face-to-Face Mtg #2 Slides - Findings		
12 Apr 2018	<b>v2</b>	<a href="#">PPTX</a>
09 Apr 2018	v1	<a href="#">PPTX</a>
Planning Questions		
09 Feb 2018	<b>v1</b>	<a href="#">PPT</a>
First Pass Document		
07 Feb 2018	<b>v4</b>	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
17 Jan 2018	v3	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
05 Jan 2018	v2	<a href="#">DOCX</a>
06 Dec 2018	v1	<a href="#">DOCX</a>

- [Implementation of WHOIS Data Reminder Policy \(WDRP, 2004\)](#)
- [FAQ: Domain Name Registrant Contact Information and ICANN's WHOIS Data Reminder Policy \(WDRP\)](#)

Further background documents may be found on the Review Team's overall Background Materials page.

### ICANN Org Briefings/Answers

- [Written implementation briefing - recs 5-9](#)
- [Responses from Global Domains Division and Contractual Compliance to 10 questions](#)
- Brussels mtg follow-up questions
  - [Written answers to compliance questions](#)
  - [Written answers to data accuracy questions](#)
- [ICANN compliance input](#), includes:
  - [Written answers to 19 March questions](#)
  - [Written answers to 20 April questions](#)
- Face-to-Face Meeting #3 follow-up questions
  - [Written answers to compliance & data accuracy questions](#)

### Open Actions/Requests

*\*To be provided once reasonable date is determined by appropriate subject-matter expert*

Item #	Source of Request	Date of Request	Action Item Request	Action Owner	Anticipated Completion Date*	Progress Notes
13	<a href="#">F2F#3</a>	27 Jul 2018	ICANN to ask SMEs to answer the question: Does ARS have access to non-public data under the Temporary Specification? Is the WHOIS data that is sampled by ARS obtained from the Registrar or Registry (for thick TLDs, since under GDPR much contact data may be redacted?)	ICANN org		
12	<a href="#">F2F#3</a>	27 Jul 2018	Lili and Alan to provide the linkage between the issues identified in the DA section and the recommendations in the Compliance section. For example, do all of the recommendations contribute to improving data accuracy?	Lili/Alan		
11	<a href="#">F2F#3</a>	27 Jul 2018	Lili to generate a recommendation that the ARS team look for potentially-anomalous results (e.g., 40% of ARS-generated tickets closed with no action because the WHOIS record changed) to determine the underlying cause.	Lili		

### Completed Actions/Requests

*\*To be provided once reasonable date is determined by appropriate subject-matter expert*

Item #	Source of Request	Date of Request	Action Item Request	Action Owner	Anticipated Completion Date*	Progress Notes	Completed Response	Completion Date
10	<a href="#">F2F#3</a>	27 Jul 2018	Ask GDD and Compliance whether there is a routine feedback process in place for Compliance to advise the ARS project of ARS-detected inaccuracies that were not ultimately found by Compliance to be inaccuracies (e.g., tickets generated because the state was missing in a country where states are not applicable)	ICANN org	03 Aug 2018		<a href="#">Email</a>	31 Aug 2018
9	<a href="#">#33</a>	09 Jul 2018	Work in collaboration with rec. 4 compliance subgroup to make sure both subgroup reports are in alignment, following comments received at ICANN62.	Lili				
8	<a href="#">#26</a>	16 Apr 2018	Lili to look into Compliance actions and link their work to data accuracy subgroup	Lili			<a href="#">Email</a>	25 May 2018
7	<a href="#">Email</a>	20 Apr 2018	Brussels follow-up list of questions to ICANN compliance	ICANN org	30 Apr 2018		<a href="#">Email</a>	01 May 2018
6	<a href="#">#26</a>	16 Apr 2018	Lili to confirm list of questions to ICANN Compliance	Lili			<a href="#">Email</a>	20 Apr 2018
5	<a href="#">Email</a>	19 Mar 2016	10 questions to address in writing briefing	ICANN org	30 Mar 2018		<a href="#">Email</a>	30 Mar 2018
4	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Participate in the 20 March briefing on P/P compliance	Subgroup	20 Mar 2018		<a href="#">Call archives</a>	20 Mar 2018
3	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Develop specific questions not covered in existing briefing and materials (if any) to be addressed by a further briefing by ICANN Org	Subgroup			<a href="#">Email</a>	19 Mar 2016
2	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Submit first draft briefing questions by this Thursday, subgroup review/comment on questions by next week, to submit questions to ICANN Org for answers to be received no later than the end of March	Subgroup			<a href="#">Email</a>	19 Mar 2016
1	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Collect key findings from each subgroup member into the report template by the end of March	Lili	31 Mar 2018		<a href="#">Email</a>	01 Apr 2018

### Decisions Reached

Source of request	Date	Decision
-------------------	------	----------

F2F#3	27 Jul 2018	The RT will not formulate an issue or recommendation regarding assessing risk of identity theft. There were no objections.
#1	06 Mar 2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lili/Dmitry to focus on following questions:               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The implementation progress of "WHOIS ACCURACY PROGRAM SPECIFICATION" in 2013 RAA.</li> <li>The progress of WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System (ARS) project and to what extent the inaccuracy has been reduced</li> </ol> </li> <li>Cathrin to focus on the following question:               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The accurate rate of WHOIS data which uses Privacy/Proxy service.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>
#1	06 Mar 2018	Subgroup to focus on Q4 "Are the measures which have been taken effective in achieving the objective?" once questions 1,2,3 have been dealt with
#1	06 Mar 2018	Question 5 (Whether we can measure data accuracy when data becomes mostly hidden?) to be included in briefing questions to the ARS team for 1-2.

### ★Objective

*Consistent with ICANN's mission and Bylaws, Section 4.6(e)(iv), the Review Team will (a) evaluate the extent to which ICANN Org has implemented each prior Directory Service Review recommendation (noting differences if any between recommended and implemented steps), (b) assess to the degree practical the extent to which implementation of each recommendation was effective in addressing the issue identified by the prior RT or generated additional information useful to management and evolution of WHOIS (RDS), and (c) determine if any specific measurable steps should be recommended to enhance results achieved through the prior RT's recommendations. This includes developing a framework to measure and assess the effectiveness of recommendations, and applying that approach to all areas of WHOIS originally assessed by the prior RT (as applicable).*

*RT1 Recommendations to be assessed by this subgroup:*

*Recommendations #5, 6, 7, 8, 9 - Data Accuracy*

★Leader/Rapporteur: Lili Sun

★Members: Cathrin Bauer-Bulst, Dmitry Belyavsky, Lili Sun, Erika Mann

★Mailing-list archives: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/rds-whois2-dataaccuracy/>

★Conference calls: see [here](#)

★Review Team Templates: see [here](#)

### Subgroup Documents

Date	Document (Versions in <b>Red</b> are latest)	File
	<b>Subgroup Report</b>	
	1.1 (if any)	DOCX
09 Feb 2018	<b>Planning Questions</b>	PPT
07 Feb 2018	<b>v1</b>	
17 Jan 2018	<b>First Pass Document</b>	DOCX
05 Jan 2018	<b>v4</b>	DOCX
06 Dec 2017	v3	DOCX
	v2	DOCX
	v1	

### Background Documents

- WHOIS1 Implementation Briefings on Recommendations 1, 2, 3, 6, 7, 9, 15, 16: [PPT](#), [PDF](#)
- WHOIS1 Implementation Briefings on Recommendations 5, 8, 10, 11: [PPT](#), [PDF](#)
- [Answers to RDS-WHOIS2 Questions on Implementation Briefings](#)
- [WHOIS Review Team \(WHOIS1\) Final Report \(2012\) and Action Plan](#)
- [WHOIS Review Team \(WHOIS1\) Implementation Reports](#), including
  - [Executive Summary of Implementation Report](#)
  - [Detailed implementation Report](#)
- Documents cited in briefing on Recommendations 5-9 include
  - [WHOIS Informational Microsite](#)
  - [WHOIS ARS December 2015 report](#), [webinar presentation](#) and recording
  - [WHOIS ARS June 2016 report](#), [webinar presentation](#) and recording

- WHOIS ARS [December 2016 report, webinar presentation and recording](#)
- WHOIS ARS [June 2017 report, webinar presentation and recording](#)
- [WHOIS ARS Compliance Metrics](#)
- [WHOIS ARS Validation Criteria](#)
- [Registrant's Benefits and Responsibilities](#)
- [Registrant Educational Series](#)
- [2014 New gTLD Registry Agreement, including Specification 4 Registration Data Publication Services](#)
- Additional links specific to Recommendation 7:
  - [2013 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [2014 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [2015 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [2016 WHOIS Annual Report](#)
  - [Contractual Compliance 2015 Annual Report](#)
- Additional links specific to Recommendation 9:
  - [Implementation of WHOIS Data Reminder Policy \(WDRP, 2004\)](#)
  - [FAQ: Domain Name Registrant Contact Information and ICANN's WHOIS Data Reminder Policy \(WDRP\)](#)

Further background documents may be found on the Review Team's overall Background Materials page.

### ICANN Org Briefings/Answers

- [Written implementation briefing - recs 5-9](#)
- [Responses from Global Domains Division and Contractual Compliance to 10 questions](#)

### Open Actions/Requests

*\*To be provided once reasonable date is determined by appropriate subject-matter expert*

Item #	Source of Request	Date of Request	Action Item Request	Action Owner	Anticipated Completion Date*	Progress Notes
--------	-------------------	-----------------	---------------------	--------------	------------------------------	----------------

### Completed Actions/Requests

*\*To be provided once reasonable date is determined by appropriate subject-matter expert*

Item #	Source of Request	Date of Request	Action Item Request	Action Owner	Anticipated Completion Date*	Progress Notes	Completed Response	Completion Date
5	<a href="#">Email</a>	19 Mar 2016	10 questions to address in writing briefing	ICANN org	30 Mar 2018		<a href="#">Email</a>	30 Mar 2018
4	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Participate in the 20 March briefing on P/P compliance	Subgroup	20 Mar 2018		<a href="#">Call archives</a>	20 Mar 2018
3	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Develop specific questions not covered in existing briefing and materials (if any) to be addressed by a further briefing by ICANN Org	Subgroup			<a href="#">Email</a>	19 Mar 2016
2	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Submit first draft briefing questions by this Thursday, subgroup review/comment on questions by next week, to submit questions to ICANN Org for answers to be received no later than the end of March	Subgroup			<a href="#">Email</a>	19 Mar 2016
1	<a href="#">#1</a>	06 Mar 2018	Collect key findings from each subgroup member into the report template by the end of March	Lili	31 Mar 2018		<a href="#">Email</a>	01 Apr 2018

### Decisions Reached

Date	Decision
06 Mar 2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lili/Dmitry to focus on following questions:               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) The implementation progress of "WHOIS ACCURACY PROGRAM SPECIFICATION" in 2013 RAA.</li> <li>2) The progress of WHOIS Accuracy Reporting System (ARS) project and to what extent the inaccuracy has been reduced</li> </ol> </li> <li>◦ Cathrin to focus on the following question:               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3) The accurate rate of WHOIS data which uses Privacy/Proxy service.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>
06 Mar 2018	Subgroup to focus on Q4 "Are the measures which have been taken effective in achieving the objective?" once questions 1,2,3 have been dealt with
06 Mar 2018	Question 5 (Whether we can measure data accuracy when data becomes mostly hidden?) to be included in briefing questions to the ARS team for 1-2.