

IDN Implementation Guidelines (IDNG) Working Group (WG)

Notes from the meeting on 18 January 2018

Meeting Attendees (in alphabetical order)

WG members:

1. Dennis Tanaka
2. Mats Dufberg
3. Satish Babu

ICANN Org:

4. Sarmad Hussain

Meeting Notes

The WG members noted that the following documents to review:

- i. Feedback from second Public Comment
- ii. Feedback from the Board IDN WG
- iii. SSAC Response
- iv. Summary of discussion from the public session at ICANN 60

The WG continued the discussion on community feedback received on the IDN Implementation Guidelines following the second public comment.

1. **JPRS-1.** WG considered rephrasing of guidelines 15 and 16 so that it only refers to script mixing but does not call it out as an exception, because JPRS does not consider Japanese as exception. Hiragana, Katakana and Han are different scripts so not calling these so may create more confusion. It could be pointed out that mixing scripts is ok in some cases, but should not move away from the guideline which asks for managing the confusable characters. Also for Chinese and Korean, it is a normal case to have mixing. It was also noted that these guidelines are a carryover from the previous version.

WG noted that confusability between Hiragana and Katakana is new information, so what is not desired is that registries using IDN tables include characters without creating proper rules to manage the confusion between such glyphs.

WG agreed to change the language so that Japanese is not considered as an exception but keep the requirement of handling confusable characters in different scripts, because Japanese do not think this as an exception.

2. **BC1-2.** WG believed that this comment does not impact the guidelines, but supports Section 2.3.
3. **BC3.** The WG considered the recommendation and agreed that security and stability should not be defined. Additional requirements of spam and malware is out of the scope of the WG's mandate.
4. **BC4-5.** No action needed.
5. **BC6.** WG considered the input from BC on limiting automatic activation. The WG noted that this is requested by the Chinese community. It may be possible to

constrain the automatic activation, based on the recommendation of SSAC. As an example, for Chinese has three variants in a set, applied-for, all simplified and all traditional. However, limiting to script and a number would be very arbitrary. The clearly conservative approach would be not to allow automatic activation.

Other communities, like Arabic script, are also considering automatically activating variant labels for international reachability.

The WG deferred till Edmon could join the discussion.

6. **BC7.** WG noted that this feedback has no impact on the guidelines.
7. **BC8.** This relates to mixing of scripts and the comment by JPRS. Perhaps one way to manage the cases is to list the scripts for which this is possible. However, we may not know all the cases. It could be noted that the cases listed may need to be updated in the future. Another way could be to note the three cases of Chinese, Japanese and Korean and then note that there may be additional cases, which could be allowed in case script mixing can be established but not arbitrarily – allows community to come and make case without revising the guidelines.

WG agreed to update the guidelines, remove the reference to “exceptions”, list the three cases and then allow for additional cases where mixing conventions are in use.

WG should also review Unicode TR 39, sections 5.1 and 5.2 – highly restrictive cases and refer to these from the guidelines.

8. **ICANN61.** WG suggested to organize a public session at ICANN 61 session followed by a private session of the IDNGWG to incorporate the feedback.

Action Items

S. No.	Action Items	Owner
1	<i>Draft responses to the comments being discussed for the WG to review</i>	SH
2	<i>Organize two IDNGWG sessions, one public session followed by a private session on IDNGWG</i>	SH